

CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN & HAMILTON LLP

One Liberty Plaza
New York, NY 10006-1470
T: +1 212 225 2000
F: +1 212 225 3999
clearygottlieb.com

WASHINGTON, D.C. • PARIS • BRUSSELS • LONDON • MOSCOW
FRANKFURT • COLOGNE • ROME • MILAN • HONG KONG • BEIJING
BUENOS AIRES • SÃO PAULO • ABU DHABI • SEOUL • SILICON VALLEY

CRAIG B. BROD
NICOLAS GRABAR
RICHARD J. COOPER
JEFFREY S. LEWIS
PAUL J. SHIM
STEVEN L. WILNER
DAVID C. LOPEZ
MICHAEL A. GERSTENZANG
LEVI L. DASSIN
JORGE U. JUANTORENA
MICHAEL D. WEINBERGER
DAVID LEINWAND
DIANA L. WOLLMAN
JEFFREY A. ROSENTHAL
MICHAEL D. DAYAN
CARMINO D. BOCCUZZI, JR.
JEFFREY D. KARP
KIMBERLY BROWN BLACKLOW
FRANCISCO L. CESTERO
FRANCESCO L. ODELL
WILLIAM L. MCRAE
JASON FACTOR
JOON H. KIM
MARGARET S. PEONIS
LISA M. SCHWEITZER
JUAN G. GIRALDEZ
DUANE MCLAUGHLIN
CHANTAL E. KORDULA
BENET J. O'REILLY
ADAM E. FLEISHER
SEAN A. O'NEAL
GLENN P. MCGRORY

MATTHEW P. SALERNO
MICHAEL J. ALBANO
VICTOR L. HOU
ROGER A. COOPER
LILLIAN TSU
AMY R. SHAPIRO
JENNIFER KENNEDY PARK
MICHAEL B. LENAS
LUKE A. BAREFOOT
JONATHAN S. KOLODNER
DANIEL ILAN
MEYER H. FEDIDA
ADRIAN R. LEIPSIK
ELIZABETH VICENS
ADAM J. BRENNEMAN
ARI D. MACKINNON
JAMES E. LANGSTON
JARED GERBER
RISHI ZUTSHI
JANE VANLARE
DAVID H. HERRINGTON
KIMBERLY R. SPOERRI
AARON J. MEYERS
DANIEL C. REYNOLDS
AUDRY X. CASUSOL
JOHN A. KUPIEC
ABENA A. MAINOO
HUGH C. CONROY, JR.
JOSEPH LANZKRON
MAURICE R. GINDI
KATHERINE R. REAVES
RAHUL MUKHI

ELANA S. BRONSON
MANUEL SILVA
KYLE A. HARRIS
LINA BENSMAN
ARON M. ZUCKERMAN
KENNETH S. BLAZEJEWSKI
MARK E. McDONALD
F. JAMAL FULTON
PAUL V. IMPERATORE
CLAYTON SIMMONS
CHARLES W. ALLEN
RESIDENT PARTNERS
JUDITH KASSEL
PENELOPE L. CHRISTOPHOU
BOAZ S. MORAG
MARY E. ALCOCK
HEIDE H. ILGENFRITZ
ANDREW WEAVER
HELENA K. GRANNIS
JOHN V. HARRISON
LAURA BAGARELLA
JONATHAN D.W. GIFFORD
SUSANNA E. PARKER
DAVID W.S. YUDIN
KARA A. HAILEY
ANNA KOGAN
BRANDON M. HAMMER
RESIDENT COUNSEL

D: +1 212-225-2086
jrosenthal@cgsh.com

VIA ECF

January 12, 2022

The Honorable Ona T. Wang
United States District Court for the Southern District of New York
500 Pearl Street
New York, NY 10007

Re: *In re Application of Vale S.A. et al.*, No. 20-mc-199-JGK-OTW

Dear Judge Wang:

We write on behalf of Vale S.A., Vale Holdings B.V., and Vale International S.A. ("Vale") in response to the letter to the Court filed yesterday by Perfectus Real Estate Corp. and Tarpley Belnord Corp. (collectively, "Perfectus"). ECF No. 118.

While Vale had not intended to respond to Perfectus's letter requesting that the Court rescind its order that Perfectus appear for a deposition by January 21, 2022, see ECF No. 118, we are constrained merely to advise the Court that Perfectus's counsel informed us this morning that Perfectus will not comply with the Court's order until it is re-affirmed by Your Honor. To minimize any claimed burden on Mr. Blackstock in light of Perfectus's representations about his inability to travel, we also offered to depose him remotely but Perfectus declined our proposal. We attach the parties' email chain on these issues, which speaks for itself.¹

Respectfully submitted,

Jeffrey A. Rosenthal

¹ Exhibit A, January 6-12, 2022 E-mail correspondence between Samuel Levander and Joseph Hellerstein.